



MONITORING REPORT
on the status of the NATIONAL CLIMATE LAWS
in selected EU countries

Justice and Environment 2024

CONTENTS

1. Introduction.....	3
2. State-of-play and overall evaluation of the National Climate Acts.....	3
3. Key elements of the National Climate Acts.....	4
3.1 Targets and carbon budgets.....	4
3.2. Provisions on planning and policy processes.....	5
3.3. Public sector mandates and new institutions.....	5
3.4. Requirements for reporting, assessment and review of progress.....	6
4. Aarhus related issues in the National Climate Acts.....	6
5. Conclusions.....	7
ANNEX - NATIONAL MONITORING REPORTS.....	8
1. Austria.....	8
2. Bulgaria.....	9
3. Czechia.....	13
4. Estonia.....	15
5. Hungary.....	18
6. Slovenia.....	20

1. Introduction

The European Climate Law requires reaching climate neutrality by 2050 and sets the intermediate target of reducing net greenhouse gas emissions by at least 55% by 2030, compared to 1990 levels. This framework poses a great challenge for the EU and its Member States. The European Climate Law includes measures to keep track of progress and adjust the actions accordingly, based on existing systems such as the energy union governance system for Member States' Integrated national energy and climate plans (NECPs). Furthermore, more than half of the EU Member States and several neighbouring countries have so far adopted or are in the process of adopting framework climate laws according to the report of CAN Europe of December 2023.¹ Around the world nearly 60 countries have introduced climate change framework laws.²

Justice and Environment have been focusing on the monitoring of climate legislation in the EU and its Member States for more than a decade. In 2024 we monitored the adoption of new and/or amendments of existing National Climate Acts in J&E countries. This collection provides an update on national climate framework acts in Austria, Bulgaria, Czechia, Estonia, Hungary and Slovenia.

2. State-of-play and overall evaluation of the National Climate Acts

In **Czechia** national climate framework law has not been either drafted or adopted so far. **Estonia** and **Slovenia** are in the adoption process, draft of the acts have already been published and presented to the Government in both countries. The **Austrian** climate law was adopted in 2017, but since the binding targets in the climate act ended in 2020 and no amendment has been issued since, it is completely ineffective. **Bulgaria** adopted its Climate Change Mitigation Act in 2014 and amended it last time this year, in 2024. In **Hungary** the national climate framework act was adopted in 2020, and it is in force since then without amendment.

The framework laws vary both in scope and content from country to country. None of the five climate change laws/drafts examined can be considered as comprehensive legislation that can effectively ensure the achievement of climate change goals. The **Estonian** and **Slovenian** drafts aim to be more comprehensive, but both lack key elements that we consider are essential for effective climate protection. The **Austrian** law exists, but it is outdated and limited in scope. Due

¹ <https://caneurope.org/climate-laws-2023/>

² Impacts of climate framework laws Lessons from Germany, Ireland and New Zealand Alina Averchenkova, Catherine Higham, Tiffanie Chan and Isabela Keuschnigg, Grantham Research Institute on Climate Change and the Environment, Policy report March 2024 <https://www.lse.ac.uk/granthaminstitute/wp-content/uploads/2024/03/Impacts-of-climate-framework-laws.pdf>

to their shortcomings, the **Bulgarian** and **Hungarian** laws are weak framework documents of the national climate change policy.

3. Key elements of the National Climate Acts

The national climate framework acts optimally establish the strategic direction for national climate change policy and often the institutional arrangements for climate action too.

Based on the policy report on the *Impacts of climate framework laws* we also assessed the following four core building blocks which should be directly created by provisions of the climate laws and lead to the most significant reported impacts in the case study countries of Grantham Research Institute on Climate Change and the Environment:³

- Targets and carbon budgets
- Provisions on planning and policy processes
- Public sector mandates and new institutions (particularly independent advisory bodies)
- Requirements for reporting, assessment and review of progress.

3.1 Targets and carbon budgets

The countries assessed show a diverse picture in terms of targets and carbon budgets in the framework legislation. There is no official carbon budget in the framework act or its draft in case of Bulgaria, Hungary, Estonia and Slovenia.

The outdated **Austrian** climate act contains carbon budget, climate targets are in the annex to the climate act in the form of carbon budgets per sector. The **Bulgarian** law does not specify any climate targets as they are outlined in the European Climate Law (2021). It does not contain a national commitment to a concretely defined, long-term and research-based emission reduction goal. The **Hungarian** climate act includes two specific binding commitments to reduce emissions by 2030 and 2050. It calls for the achievement of full climate neutrality by 2050 and a reduction in domestic emissions of at least 40% by 2030, compared with emissions in 1990. The 2030 emissions reduction target is too weak, placing a disproportionate burden on future generations to reduce emissions beyond 2030. In case of **Estonia** the draft sets national emission reduction targets by 2030, 2035, 2040 and 2050, but by setting these targets, Estonia backslides from targets previously set in national law and communicated to the EU in its NECP. In the **draft of Slovenia** climate neutrality is aimed by 2045, but there are no intermediary goals. Further, there are no defined targets for either greenhouse gas reduction or carbon sink enhancement.

³ Impacts of climate framework laws, page 5

3.2. Provisions on planning and policy processes

Specific provisions on planning and policy processes are included in the framework act (or its drafts) of Austria, Bulgaria, Estonia and Slovenia. The **Austrian law** foresees negotiations to determine the carbon budgets after each commitment period. In case of **Bulgaria** and **Estonia** the laws refer to the NECP and the adaptation strategy of the country. Beyond the NECP and the future National Adaptation Strategy, the **Slovenian draft** addresses a wider range of planning and policy processes. The law addresses the Long-term Climate Strategy of Slovenia, the regional action plans for climate adaptation, the Social Climate Plan, also general provisions on coordination of all national strategies and legislation with the Long-term Climate Strategy, the Climate Adaptation Strategy and NECP, as well as the coordinators of NECP measures in each ministry, who supervise the implementation of NECP measures in each sector.

3.3. Public sector mandates and new institutions

With regard to public sector mandates and new institutions, in particular independent advisory bodies, the framework laws are again diversified. There are advisory bodies in the laws/drafts of Austria, Bulgaria, Estonia and Slovenia. Still in the **Bulgarian** advisory body, National Expert Council on Climate Change to support the implementation of Bulgaria's climate change policy, the non-governmental members are in minority, moreover it does not function with transparency and accountability (e. g. it does not have a separate website or section on the Ministry's website where its sessions and decisions could be monitored). The **Estonian draft** establishes the Climate Council, an independent expert body that advises the Government on a science-based climate policy and reviews climate targets and the progress towards them. The **Slovenian draft** law provides for an existing and transparent institution in climate policy to ensure the independence and transparency of climate policy processes. The Climate council⁴ is a scientific and NGO body which supports decision makers and gives expert opinions on climate strategies, measures, legislation etc. and is being transposed from the Environmental Act (<https://pisrs.si/pregledPredpisa?id=ZAKO8286>) to the Climate Act. There are no specific roles defined for state institutions, but since the act includes ETS provisions, the Slovenian Climate Fund, airplane and boat emissions and other provisions, the inspectorate for the environment (already existing in Slovenia) and other already existing inspectorates are defined as

⁴ The Climate Council has its subpage on the webpage of the Ministry -> <https://www.gov.si/zbirke/delovna-telesa/podnebni-svet/> On this page there are the rules of operating which they agreed on in the first meeting, and then all the official minutes of all the meetings and all of their opinions (like on fossil subsidies or the Energy Act).

competent supervision and control bodies.

3.4. Requirements for reporting, assessment and review of progress

The **Bulgarian** and **Hungarian** climate change framework laws do not specify any **requirements for reporting, assessment and review of progress**. The **Austrian** climate act includes an obligation for the competent ministry to submit a report in the yearly progress to the national climate protection committee and the parliament. Apart from the reporting obligation, the law contains a "responsibility mechanism", but it is a non-existent tool. According to the **Estonian legislative draft** a yearly report on Estonia's GHG emissions and progress towards the targets, including proposals for amended or new measures, is to be composed and published, including a simplified summary. Every other year, it is also to include a prognosis on Estonia's GHG emissions. With longer intervals, the report will include an assessment of economic competitiveness, the adequacy of the emission reduction targets, an overview of novel technologies (including CCS), an analysis of economic measures counterproductive to the achievement of environmental objectives, and a climate risk assessment. Moreover, the Climate Council is to give its review to the abovementioned report. Detailed provisions on reporting, evaluation and review of progress are included in the **draft Slovenian Climate Act**. The coordinators from ministries (Article 12/(4)) meet at least twice per year and review the implementation of the NECP measures allocated to each ministry. They meet at least once per year with the Climate council (Article 18). The adaptation strategy is to be renewed at least every 10 years (Article 13) based on the projections and updates to the risk and vulnerability assessments. The Climate Council (Article 18) creates yearly reports on their activities and the state of climate, while giving its opinion on the implementation of relevant strategies and NECP and proposing possible improvements. Within the ETS system the standard, already existing reporting system is transposed. GHG progress reviews are to be done on a yearly basis for two years back and a draft review is to be prepared for the last year by the Slovenian Environmental Agency (ARSO, Article 62). This information will be publicly available. Ministry prepares a yearly report on climate mitigation, prepares a report on climate adaptation every second year, and supplies a projection of GHG emissions and LULUCF (Articles 64 - 66). The Environmental Agency prepares and regularly updates climate indicators, which are the basis for progress review of both main strategies (adaptation and mitigation) and NECP.

4. Aarhus related issues in the National Climate Acts

Provisions on public participation and access to justice are not to be found at all in the framework laws of **Austria** and **Hungary**. The **Bulgarian** law contains some provisions on access

to information, but as there are no provisions on the setting of climate targets and related reporting and review of progress, there are no specific provisions on public participation. The **Estonian draft** also contains only vague provisions on public participation, simply providing that relevant stakeholders must be engaged at the earliest possible stage in the drafting of relevant plans and in the assessment of the adequacy of climate targets, moreover the information must be published, e.g. the yearly climate report, its underlying data and methodology, and a simplified summary of the report. Similarly, the **proposed Slovenian** Climate Act contains only a few elements of public participation rights in environmental matters. It defines the ‘principle of cooperation’, which loosely stipulates that institutions of state and municipalities must include climate policies in all areas and sectors of their work, and that all relevant stakeholders must be included in preparation, adoption and implementation of climate policies. However, there are specific provisions which would evolve the principle, which specifically include obligatory participation with the general public, experts, NGOs, representatives of the economic system and municipalities, but does not exclude other possible stakeholders. Legal remedies are explicitly available only in context of receiving funds from the Slovenian Climate Fund and ETS system. There are no remedies regarding general climate goals, strategies or acts.

It can be concluded that the full range of Aarhus rights are not covered in the climate framework laws of the participating J&E Member States. The instruments for enforcing the implementation of national legislation, in particular climate targets, are weak in the countries assessed.

5. Conclusions

Based on the six national monitoring reports these are the key lacking provisions in most of the analysed climate acts and drafts:

- defined targets for either greenhouse gas reduction or carbon sink enhancement, linked to national carbon budgets,
- independent advisory bodies, guarantees of transparency and accountability,
- comprehensive requirements for reporting, assessment and review of progress,
- full range of Aarhus participatory rights.

Moreover, the analysed climate framework acts cannot fulfill the need for all-encompassing law regarding planning and climate policy processes.

ANNEX – NATIONAL MONITORING REPORTS

1. Austria

Name of the Member State	Austria
Date of adoption / comprehensive amendment of the national climate framework law	20.03.2017
Overall evaluation of the framework law in a nutshell	Since the binding targets in the climate act ended in 2020 and no amendment has been issued since, it is completely ineffective. Also, before 2020 the climate act only contained the carbon budgets for each year but no mechanism to respond to a non-compliance with the budgets. Thus, it was already ineffective since the beginning.
BUILDING BLOCKS of the climate law⁵	
Climate targets in the framework law	Climate targets are in the annex to the climate act in the form of carbon budgets per sector.
Carbon budgets (where available or applicable)	Carbon budgets are in the annex and have to be newly determined after the commitment periods have elapsed (2008-2012 & 2013-2020). Since 2020 there are no carbon budgets, since the necessary amendments were not issued.
Provisions on planning and policy processes (especially which strategies does the law include or purpose, is there specifically an adaptation strategy included)	§ 3 para 2 foresees negotiations to determine the carbon budgets after each commitment period. § 6 includes an obligation for the competent ministry to submit a report in the yearly progress to the national climate protection committee and the parliament.
Public sector mandates and new institutions	There is an advisory body established in § 4 of the act, which has a general mandate to discuss fundamental questions relating to Austrian climate policy.

⁵ <https://www.lse.ac.uk/granthaminstitute/wp-content/uploads/2024/03/Impacts-of-climate-framework-laws.pdf>

(particularly are there independent advisory bodies, are there roles and obligations of specific state institutions and other stakeholders clearly defined in the law or are the provisions more general)	
Provisions on requirements for reporting, assessment and review of progress	Other than the abovementioned progress-report in § 6 of the act, which has to be submitted to the national climate protection committee, there is a “Responsibility-Mechanism” foreseen in § 7 of the act. This is however to be determined in a separate agreement which was never concluded.
Provisions on public participation (regarding both setting climate goals and reporting, review of progress)	None.
Enforcement of the framework law and its goals - legal remedies	None.
availability of administrative procedures	None.
availability of judicial procedures	None.

2. Bulgaria

Name of the Member State	Bulgaria
---------------------------------	----------

<p>Date of adoption/comprehensive amendment of the national climate framework law</p>	<p>The Climate Change Mitigation Act (CCMA)⁶ was adopted, duly promulgated in the State Gazette and entered into force on 13 March, 2014. Since then, CCMA was amended many times, the last amendment dating back to May 2024.</p>
<p>Overall evaluation of the framework law in a nutshell</p>	<p>The CCMA is a framework climate law which transposes the requirements of 7 EU directives and contains measures on the implementation of 5 Decisions (two of the European Commission (EC) and three of the European Parliament and of the Council) and 12 EU Regulations.</p> <p>This is the scope of the Act in its current version does not ensure fully the enhancement of climate governance and achieving the Paris Agreement's goals and European Climate Law's climate neutrality target by 2050. There is a question as to whether there is a need for a complete overhaul or significant amendments in the law. In either case, a new law or substantial law's revision should contain a long-term national goal to achieve climate neutrality in Bulgaria by 2050; introducing an interim climate target to reduce emissions by 2040; provisions for strengthening the role of the National Expert Council on Climate Change, and for ensuring accountability and transparency regarding the implementation of climate policies in line with the requirements set out in the EU Governance Regulation.</p>
<p>BUILDING BLOCKS of the climate law⁷</p>	
<p>Climate targets in the framework law</p>	<p>The law does not specify any climate targets as they are outlined in the European Climate Law (2021). It does not contain a national commitment to a concretely defined, long-term and research-based emission reduction goal. Concerning any targets in the law, Art. 57 states that the revenues from the sale by auction of all installation quotas allocated to the Republic of Bulgaria could be used to finance certain activities, incl. development of renewable energy sources with a view to meeting the European Union's target of 32% of the share of energy from renewable sources in gross final energy consumption, as well as for the development of renewable energy sources, other technologies contributing to the transition to a safe and sustainable, low-carbon economy and helping to meet the 32.5% energy efficiency target by 2030.</p>
<p>Carbon budgets</p>	<p>There is no direct provision regarding carbon budgets in the law.</p> <p>However, the sectoral ministries implementing the climate state policies in the</p>

⁶ <https://lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2136124027>

⁷ <https://www.lse.ac.uk/granthaminstitute/wp-content/uploads/2024/03/Impacts-of-climate-framework-laws.pdf>

(where available or applicable)	field of transport, energy, construction, agriculture and forestry, tourism, industry, regional development, health care and other fields need to plan in their ministry budgets funds to fulfil their obligations and in the exercise of their powers in the field of climate change.
<p>Provisions on planning and policy processes</p> <p>(especially which strategies does the law include or purpose, is there specifically an adaptation strategy included)</p>	<p>There is a special section on strategies and plans in the law (Art.8-10 CCMA). The Minister of Environment and Water together with the Minister of Energy, assisted by other sectoral ministries develop an Integrated Plan in the field of energy and climate (the national NECP) of the Republic of Bulgaria according to Regulation (EU) 2018/1999 of the European Parliament and of the Council of December 11, 2018. on the management of the Energy Union and climate action.</p> <p>The Minister of Environment and Water together with the competent ministers and after consultation with the National Expert Council on Climate Change prepare a draft of a national strategy for the main measures of adaptation to the consequences of climate change. The adaptation strategy is prepared for a period of no less than 20 years, with the exception of the first strategy, which is prepared for the period until 2030. The strategy is adopted by the Council of Ministers.</p>
<p>Public sector mandates and new institutions</p> <p>(particularly are there independent advisory bodies, are there roles and obligations of specific state institutions and other stakeholders clearly defined in the law or are the</p>	<p>To the Minister of Environment and Water is established a National Expert Council on Climate Change as an advisory body to support the implementation of Bulgaria's climate change policy. The activity of the Council is regulated by Rules of procedure approved by an order of the Minister of Environment and Water. A majority of its members represent different ministries and government agencies, and a minority are members of the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, of the National Association of Local Municipalities and of NGOs whose activities are related to climate change mitigation. It does not function with transparency and accountability (e. g. it does not have a separate website or section on the Ministry's website where its sessions and decisions could be monitored). (Art.3(4-5) CCMA)</p>

provisions more general)	
Provisions on requirements for reporting, assessment and review of progress	<p>There are no specific provisions on reporting, assessment and review of progress in the CCMA since there are no climate targets set in the law.</p> <p>The Minister of Environment and Water, assisted by the sectoral ministries prepares updates and reports on the progress of the NECP.</p> <p>Also, the Republic of Bulgaria annually reports to the UNFCCC Secretariat the national inventory of greenhouse gas emissions under the UNFCCC and the Kyoto Protocol.</p>
Provisions on public participation (regarding both setting climate goals and reporting, review of progress)	<p>Since there are no provisions on setting climate goals and related reporting and review of progress, there are not specific provisions on public participation.</p> <p>The CCMA does not provide for public participation in the decision-making process and in shaping of climate policies. The involvement of the public is really reduced mostly to passive awareness of strictly technical issues, such as the national greenhouse gas emissions stocktaking reports.</p> <p>For instance, according to Art. 62, the Minister of the Environment and Water is bound to provide to the public comprehensive information on emission allowances, project activities and emission reporting with the direct participation of Bulgarian citizens or authorised third parties, depending on the nature of the required information.</p> <p>Under Art. 63 of the CCMA, the Executive Director of the Executive Environment Agency (EEA) publishes annually, on the EEA website, national reports on the greenhouse gas emissions stocktaking in the Republic of Bulgaria⁸; annual verified reports by installation and aircraft operators and the names of installation and aircraft operators who violate the requirement to allocate sufficient allowances corresponding to their verified emissions.</p>
Enforcement of the framework law and its goals - legal remedies	<p>There are legal remedies available only in context of ETS. E.g., the decisions of the executive director of the EEA in his capacity as a national administrator according to Regulation (EU) No. 389/2013 for opening or closing accounts, or approving a change of authorized representatives by account and updating the information by account in the national registry for trading greenhouse gas emission allowances could be appealed in accordance with the Administrative Procedure Code - in administrative or judicial procedure.</p> <p>Since there are no provisions on setting climate goals and related reporting and review of progress, there are not specific provisions, there are no remedies in this regard. Also, there are no remedies to directly challenge the strategies provided in the CCMA. However, a judicial review is possible in the SEA</p>

⁸ <https://eea.government.bg/bg/dokladi/unfccc>

	procedure, e.g. to challenge the SEA of the NECP.
Availability of administrative procedures	See above.
Availability of judicial procedures	See above.

3. Czechia

Name of the Member State	Czechia
Date of adoption / comprehensive amendment of the national climate framework law	National climate framework law has not been adopted so far. The only regulation available is the “Climate protection policy”, a strategic document approved by government decision. The document was updated in March 2024; however, the new version is still subject to the government’s approval to enter into effect. Thus, the old version of the “Climate protection policy” from 2017 constitutes the current regulatory framework in this field.
Overall evaluation of the framework law in a nutshell	The non-existence of the national climate framework law results in negative evidence of the lack of State action in the environmental field. The 2017 “Climate protection policy” document is outdated and not in compliance with international obligations in the field of environmental protection. There are indications that the updated “Climate protection policy” from 2024 will not be approved due to the current political considerations.
BUILDING BLOCKS of the climate law⁹	
Climate targets in the framework law	There is no framework law. The Climate protection policy document from March 2024 includes the target of reducing greenhouse gas emissions by at least 55%

⁹ <https://www.lse.ac.uk/granthaminstitute/wp-content/uploads/2024/03/Impacts-of-climate-framework-laws.pdf>

	by 2030.
Carbon budgets (where available or applicable)	There is no official carbon budget. The only carbon budget calculated for the purposes of the ongoing climate litigation proceedings was drawn by independent stakeholders and remains unofficial.
Provisions on planning and policy processes (especially which strategies does the law include or purpose, is there specifically an adaptation strategy included)	-
Public sector mandates and new institutions (particularly are there independent advisory bodies, are there roles and obligations of specific state institutions and other stakeholders clearly defined in the law or are the provisions more general)	-
Provisions on requirements for reporting, assessment and review of progress	-
Provisions on public participation (regarding both setting climate goals and reporting, review of progress)	-
Enforcement of the framework law and its goals - legal remedies	-
availability of administrative procedures	-

availability of judicial procedures	-
-------------------------------------	---

4. Estonia

Name of the Member State	Estonia
Date of adoption / comprehensive amendment of the national climate framework law	N/A (the Climate-Resilient Economy Act is being drafted and was presented to the Government on the 5th of December, 2024). The act hopefully enters into force in 2025, but that is not guaranteed.
Overall evaluation of the framework law in a nutshell	(Regarding the draft as of the 5th of December, 2024): Poor. Emission reduction targets far exceed Estonia's fair share of the global carbon budget, adaptation is very superficially regulated, and there is no clear access to justice in case targets are not complied with.
BUILDING BLOCKS of the climate law¹⁰	
Climate targets in the framework law	(In the draft as of the 5th of December, 2024): National emission reduction targets: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2030 - emissions don't exceed these of 2022 • 2035 - emission reduction by 29% from 2022 • 2040 - emission reduction by 57% from 2022 • 2050 - climate neutrality By setting these targets, Estonia backslides from targets previously set in national law and communicated to the EU in its NECP. The act also includes sector-based emission reduction targets for these years. The targets for industry, including shale oil production stand out sharply, as they allow the sector to substantially increase (!) emissions at least until 2035.

¹⁰ <https://www.lse.ac.uk/granthaminstitute/wp-content/uploads/2024/03/Impacts-of-climate-framework-laws.pdf>

<p>Carbon budgets (where available or applicable)</p>	<p>(In the draft as of the 5th of December, 2024):</p> <p>Not applied, although the Ministry of Climate commissioned and published a study in 2024 to quantify Estonia's carbon budgets, which was supposed to serve as an input for the Climate Act.</p>
<p>Provisions on planning and policy processes (especially which strategies does the law include or purpose, is there specifically an adaptation strategy included)</p>	<p>(In the draft as of the 5th of December, 2024):</p> <p>The draft imposes an obligation on the state institutions and municipalities "to take into account to the largest extent possible" the principles and objectives of the act and the assessment of climate risks in planning activities and administrative procedures.</p> <p>The draft defines the NECP as a summary of Estonia's existing climate goals and measures.</p> <p>The draft only sets out very general adaptation objectives with no deadlines or no one in particular responsible for these. It also includes a provision to set out more specific objectives in thematic development and action programmes, but does not foresee a comprehensive adaptation strategy.</p>
<p>Public sector mandates and new institutions (particularly are there independent advisory bodies, are there roles and obligations of specific state institutions and other stakeholders clearly defined in the law or are the provisions more general)</p>	<p>(In the draft as of the 5th of December, 2024):</p> <p>The provisions regarding the public sector are general in nature. The achievement of national or sector-specific emission reduction targets is not anyone's responsibility in particular.</p> <p>The draft sets out a new obligation for municipalities to compose their energy and climate plans and for larger towns to also draft a plan on the integration of urban space and nature.</p> <p>It is clearly defined that the Ministry of Climate is responsible for drafting the NECP and for organising the yearly climate mitigation and adaptation report.</p>

	It establishes the Climate Council, an independent expert body that advises the Government on a science-based climate policy and reviews climate targets and the progress towards them.
Provisions on requirements for reporting, assessment and review of progress	<p>(In the draft as of the 5th of December, 2024):</p> <p>A yearly report on Estonia's GHG emissions and progress towards the targets, including proposals for amended or new measures, is to be composed and published, including a simplified summary. Every other year, it is also to include a prognosis on Estonia's GHG emissions. With longer intervals, the report will include an assessment of economic competitiveness, the adequacy of the emission reduction targets, an overview of novel technologies (including CCS), an analysis of economic measures counterproductive to the achievement of environmental objectives, and a climate risk assessment.</p> <p>The Climate Council is to give its review to the abovementioned report.</p> <p>Based on the climate report, the Minister of Climate will propose to the Government to update the climate targets, if necessary.</p>
Provisions on public participation (regarding both setting climate goals and reporting, review of progress)	<p>(In the draft as of the 5th of December, 2024):</p> <p>Provisions are extremely vague, simply providing that relevant stakeholders must be engaged at the earliest possible stage in the drafting of relevant plans mentioned above and in the assessment of the adequacy of climate targets. Also, the draft of the Climate Act provides that information must be published, e.g. the yearly climate report, its underlying data and methodology, and a simplified summary of the report.</p>
Enforcement of the framework law and its goals - legal remedies	<p>(In the draft as of the 5th of December, 2024):</p> <p>Nothing new is explicitly provided regarding legal remedies in case of inadequate climate change</p>

	mitigation and/or adaptation.
availability of administrative procedures	(In the draft as of the 5th of December, 2024): Nothing new is explicitly provided regarding administrative procedures in case of inadequate climate change mitigation and/or adaptation.
availability of judicial procedures	(In the draft as of the 5th of December, 2024): Nothing new is explicitly provided regarding judicial procedures in case of inadequate climate change mitigation and/or adaptation.

5. Hungary

Name of the Member State	Hungary
Date of adoption / comprehensive amendment of the national climate framework law	2020 (Act No. XLIV. of 2020 on climate protection)
Overall evaluation of the framework law in a nutshell	In a nutshell it is an extremely brief and fundamentally incomplete act. The act includes two specific binding commitments to reduce emissions by 2030 and 2050, but the law lacks the institutions to implement the objectives set, the resources allocated for implementation and the legal guarantees for implementation.
BUILDING BLOCKS of the climate law¹¹	
Climate targets in the framework law	The Hungarian climate act calls for the achievement of full climate neutrality by 2050 and a reduction in domestic emissions of at least 40% by 2030, compared

¹¹ <https://www.lse.ac.uk/granthaminstitute/wp-content/uploads/2024/03/Impacts-of-climate-framework-laws.pdf>

	<p>with emissions in 1990.</p> <p>The 2030 emissions reduction target is too weak, placing a disproportionate burden on future generations to reduce emissions beyond 2030. The 2030 emissions reduction target can be met with less than a quarter of the global average emissions reductions recommended by the IPCC to stay within 1.5 degrees by 2030. However, the 2050 target can only realistically be achieved if the 2030 interim target is significantly exceeded.</p>
<p>Carbon budgets (where available or applicable)</p>	No provisions.
<p>Provisions on planning and policy processes (especially which strategies does the law include or purpose, is there specifically an adaptation strategy included)</p>	<p>The legislation stipulates that national climate policy must be in line with our international and EU commitments on climate protection but refers not any specific climate policy documents.</p> <p>It states as a principle that the possibility of carbon-neutral nuclear energy should also be considered, refers to the polluter pays principle and lays down that the national climate policy shall be based on the logic of proportionate and realistic interventions.</p> <p>The act authorises the government to draw up certain measures and programmes but does not specify their content or deadlines.</p>
<p>Public sector mandates and new institutions (particularly are there independent advisory bodies, are there roles and obligations of specific state institutions and other stakeholders clearly defined in the law or are the provisions more general)</p>	No, there are no provisions.
<p>Provisions on requirements for reporting, assessment and review of progress</p>	No provisions.

Provisions on public participation (regarding both setting climate goals and reporting, review of progress)	No provision.
Enforcement of the framework law and its goals - legal remedies	
availability of administrative procedures	No legal remedies are available
availability of judicial procedures	No legal remedies are available

6. Slovenia

Name of the Member State	Slovenia
Date of adoption / comprehensive amendment of the national climate framework law	Not adopted yet (to be forwarded to the Government for adoption and then adoption in the Parliament), last draft from 18.7.2024 -> https://e-uprava.gov.si/si/drzava-in-druzba/e-demokracija/predlogi-predpisov/predlog-predpisa.html?id=16041
Overall evaluation of the framework law in a nutshell	<p>The Slovenian Climate Act represents a substantial improvement especially from these points of view:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - CO2 tax funds will have to be used specifically for climate measures (they will no longer be a part of the general state budget). - 37% of the state budget will have to be used for sustainable (climate proofing included) measures. - Net neutrality target is set for 2045. - There are several provisions on regular review of process in implementing climate measures. <p>Negative sides are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No carbon budget. - No intermediary goals (2030, 2040...).

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No special provisions regarding legal remedies and no clearly defined responsibility of the state. - No provisions on ending fossil fuel subsidies (these were removed from the Act after public consultations).
Climate targets in the framework law	<p>Climate neutrality 2045.</p> <p>GHG reduction and carbon sink increase (no defined goals).</p> <p>Adaptation to climate change (Strategy for adaptation).</p>
Carbon budgets (where available or applicable)	<p>No carbon budget defined.</p>
Provisions on planning and policy processes (especially which strategies does the law include or purpose, is there specifically an adaptation strategy included)	<p>The Act addresses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the Long-term Climate Strategy of Slovenia, - the Slovenian NECP, - the Slovenian Climate Adaptation Strategy (which is to be adopted within 18 months of Climate Act adoption), - Regional action plans for climate adaptation, - Social Climate Plan, - General provisions on coordination of all national strategies and legislation with the Long-term Climate Strategy, the Climate Adaptation Strategy and NECP, - coordinators of NECP measures in each ministry, who supervise the implementation of NECP measures in each sector.
Public sector mandates and new institutions (particularly are there independent advisory bodies, are there roles and obligations of specific state institutions and other stakeholders clearly defined in the law or are the provisions more general)	<p>Climate council ('Podnebni svet' - scientific+NGO body which supports decision makers and gives expert opinions on climate strategies, measures, legislation etc.) is being transposed from the Environmental Act (https://pisrs.si/pregledPredpisa?id=ZAKO8286) to the Climate Act.</p> <p>Climate coordinators (persons from each ministry) will have to be picked to supervise implementation of NECP (climate) measures for each sector (Article 12).</p>

	<p>There are no specific roles defined for state institutions, but since the act includes ETS provisions, the Slovenian Climate Fund, airplane and boat emissions and other provisions, the inspectorate for the environment (already existing in Slovenia) and other already existing inspectorates are defined as competent supervision and control bodies.</p>
<p>Provisions on requirements for reporting, assessment and review of progress</p>	<p>The coordinators from ministries (Article 12/(4)) meet at least 2x per year and review the implementation of the NECP measures allocated to each ministry. They meet at least once per year with the Climate council (Article 18).</p> <p>The adaptation strategy is to be renewed at least every 10 years (Article 13) based on the projections and updates to the risk and vulnerability assessments.</p> <p>The coordination of all national strategic and legislative acts (Article 17) stipulates that acts need to be assessed in advance of being adopted, and that the coordinators from the paragraph above separately assess these new acts through the initiative given by their ministry.</p> <p>The Climate Council (Article 18) creates yearly reports on their activities and the state of climate, while giving its opinion on the implementation of relevant strategies and NECP and proposing possible improvements.</p> <p>Within the ETS system the standard, already existing reporting system is transposed.</p> <p>GHG progress reviews are to be done on a yearly basis for two years back and a draft review is to be prepared for the last year by the Slovenian Environmental Agency (ARSO, Article 62). This information will be publicly available.</p> <p>Ministry prepares a yearly report on climate mitigation, prepares a report on climate adaptation every second year, and supplies a projection of GHG emissions and</p>

	<p>LULUCF (Articles 64 - 66).</p> <p>The Environmental Agency prepares and regularly updates climate indicators, which are the basis for progress review of both main strategies (adaptation and mitigation) and NECP.</p>
<p>Provisions on public participation</p> <p>(regarding both setting climate goals and reporting, review of progress)</p>	<p>Article 6 defines the 'principle of cooperation', which loosely stipulates that institutions of state and municipalities must include climate policies in all areas and sectors of their work, and that all relevant stakeholders must be included in preparation, adoption and implementation of climate policies.</p> <p>There are no specific provisions which would evolve the principle, which specifically includes obligatory participation with the general public, experts, NGOs, representatives of the economic system and municipalities, but does not exclude other possible stakeholders.</p>
<p>Enforcement of the framework law and its goals - legal remedies</p>	<p>There are legal remedies explicitly available only in context of receiving funds from the Slovenian Climate Fund and ETS system. There are no remedies regarding general climate goals, strategies or acts.</p>
<p>availability of administrative procedures</p>	<p>Same as above.</p>
<p>availability of judicial procedures</p>	<p>Same as above.</p>

Contact

Association of Justice and Environment

European Network of Environmental Law Organizations

33 Udolní, 602 00 Brno, Czech Republic

Plamen Peev & Aljosa Petek

(Co-leaders / Climate Topic Team)

e-mail: info@justiceandenvironment.org

web: www.justiceandenvironment.org



Funded by the European Union. Views and opinions expressed are however those of the author(s) only and do not necessarily reflect those of the European Union or CINEA. Neither the European Union nor the granting authority can be held responsible for them.